Grade 6 Playlist: Compare and Contrast the Experience of Reading to Listening or Viewing

Aligns with CCSS.ELA-LITERACY.RL.6.7:

- Compare and contrast the experience of reading a story, drama, or poem to listening to or viewing an audio, video, or live version of the text, including contrasting what they "see" and "hear" when reading the text to what they perceive when they listen or watch.

Welcome

Have you ever watched a movie that was based on a book? Or have you listened to an audio recording of a poem? Texts can be presented through different ways called *mediums*. Reading a story in digital or print form is one way to experience a text. However, that same story could also be told through other mediums, such as audio, video, or even live stage performances. The way a text is presented affects the way the audience experiences it. By examining audio, visual, and live presentations of texts, readers will gain a deeper understanding of the each medium's unique strengths and weaknesses.

Objectives

In this playlist, students will learn how to:

- recognize that people experience and understand texts differently depending on the mediums used to present them.
- compare and contrast the experience of reading a poem and listening to an audio recording of the same poem.

Exploring the Standard

Engaging with a written text requires the reader to interact with the text in a personal way. The reader uses his or her imagination to visualize the world of the story. This is different from the kind of interaction that occurs when someone listens to an audio book or watches a film adaptation of the same story. In a film, for example, the director and actors, not the audience, fill in the details left uncertain by the story. It's important for readers to recognize how their perception of a written text can change after hearing or viewing a presentation of it. This helps them recognize the advantages and disadvantages of each medium.

A Closer Look: The Differences Between the Mediums

Readers can contrast what they "see" and "hear" when reading a written text with what they perceive while listening to or viewing an audio or visual version. The largest difference is the level of interaction that each medium requires from the audience.

Although the experience of reading a written text requires the most interaction, readers are free to perceive the elements of the story, poem, or drama as they imagine them. This means that characters will sound however the reader thinks they would. When characters appear in the reader's mind, they will look however he or she imagines.

Wisewire
Copyright © 2016. All rights reserved.

On the other hand, audio, video, and live presentations limit the audience's freedom to perceive the elements of the story. The speaker in an audio book will have the voice of whichever performer is hired to record it. The characters in a play will have the physical features of the actors who portray them on stage. A strong story can be successfully adapted to several mediums, but the different styles of presentation mean that the audience's experience will be different as well.

Read the following chart to learn key features of common mediums used to present a text.

Medium	Key Features
Written Text	• Allows the reader to fully concentrate on the information presented • Grants the reader the most freedom to perceive the elements of the story, poem, or play • Does not provide audio evidence of the emotions portrayed in the text • Usually does not provide visual evidence of the emotions portrayed in the text (some texts do include pictures)
Audio Presentation	• Allows the audience to concentrate on the emotional delivery of what is said • Conveys the presenters' perceptions of the story, poem, or play • Partially limits the audience's freedom to perceive the elements of the story, poem, or play • Can be more difficult to understand without the corresponding text
Video/Live Presentation	• Gives the audience an experience that might seem like a more "real" version of the text • Conveys the presenters' perceptions of the story, poem, or play • Greatly limits the audience's freedom to perceive the elements of the story, poem, or play • Can be more difficult to understand without the corresponding text • Can be distracting if it includes anything that does not pertain to the information being presented, such as a background character, prop, or set • Sometimes presents an edited version of the text to better suit the visual medium

Watch!

Watch this video to learn more about comparing and contrasting the ways to experience a text:

https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=HOxYFY8rNV4

In the following poem by Robert Frost, the speaker remembers a winter evening walk with only the distant sights and sounds of human life to keep him company. While reading, determine the mood and character of the speaker in the poem. What emotions does the speaker express? How would he or she sound? Pay attention to how a reader might read the lines as well. When might a reader pause? Where might a reader add emphasis to certain words or phrases?

Wisewire
Copyright © 2016. All rights reserved.

Example

"Good Hours" by Robert Frost

I had for my winter evening walk—
No one at all with whom to talk,
But I had the cottages in a row
Up to their shining eyes in snow.
[5] And I thought I had the folk within:
I had the sound of a violin;
I had a glimpse through curtain laces
Of youthful forms and youthful faces.
I had such company outward bound.
[10] I went till there were no cottages found.
I turned and repented, but coming back
I saw no window but that was black.
Over the snow my creaking feet
Disturbed the slumbering village street
[15] Like profanation, by your leave,
At ten o'clock of a winter eve.

Hint!

Remember that the mood of a poem describes how the reader feels while he or she is reading the poem. How might a reader feel when reading "Good Hours"?

Now, listen to the following recording of a man reading the same poem. While listening, pay attention to any differences between the two mediums. Do any moments in the speaker's performance sound strange or surprising? Could a reader's understanding of the poem change after he or she hears an audio presentation of it? Which experience might a reader prefer?

Wisewire
Copyright © 2016. All rights reserved.

Listen!

Click the link below to listen to the poem:
http://ia902605.us.archive.org/24/items/good_hours_librivox/goodhours_frost_add.mp3

Listening to the audio version of the poem is a different experience than reading it silently. In the case of an audio or video recording, the performer makes important decisions to deliver the poem. A reader may not always agree with them. An audio or video recording may also contain extra information. This leads to a variety of experiences.

First, a brief introduction is spoken at the beginning of the audio recording of the poem. The poem itself is followed by copyright information. A written version of the poem does not often contain obvious publication information.

Second, while reading the poem, the audience is free to imagine any voice speaking the lines. For the audio recording, the voice is already decided. The performer likely does not sound like the reader imagined the speaker should sound. This difference may change the reader's perception.

Lastly, reading a poem requires the reader to pay attention to punctuation marks and line breaks, which indicate when to pause or stop reading. Did the speaker pause at any points where a reader may not? Was there a line that seemed to be spoken too quickly or too slowly?

Hint!

Readers can use a Venn diagram to compare and contrast their experience of reading a poem with their experience of listening to a poem.

Watch!

Watch this video version of Robert Frost's "Good Hours." Compare and contrast this visual version with the print and audio versions.

https://vimeo.com/95669223

Applying the Standard

Choose a story, drama, or poem for which there is also a video or live performance version. Read the passage and imagine the elements of the story. Then, watch the video version of the text or attend a stage performance. How do the experiences differ? How are they alike? Which experience do you prefer, and why?

Wisewire
Copyright © 2016. All rights reserved.

Self-Check: RL.6.7

Read the passage and view the video. Then answer the questions.

Excerpt from *Little Lord Fauntleroy*
by Frances Hodgson Burnett

Video: (1:19:05-1:28:55) https://archive.org/details/little_lord_fauntleroy

At the beginning of the story, Cedric Errol lives with his American mother in New York City. His father, who died when Cedric was very young, was the youngest son of an English earl. One day, Cedric learns that he is now heir to his grandfather's estate because all of his uncles have died. Cedric travels to England to live with his grandfather, the Earl. Cedric's mother accompanies him, but she is forced to live in a separate house because the Earl disapproves of her. After some time, however, another woman claims that her son, not Cedric, is the true heir to the estate. At this point in the story, the Earl goes to see this woman, who is calling herself Lady Fauntleroy. He then pays a visit to Cedric's mother, Mrs. Errol.

1 The fact was that the Earl had stalked into the room and stood, looking like a venerable aristocratic giant, staring at the woman from under his beetling brows, and not condescending a word. He simply stared at her, taking her in from head to foot as if she were some repulsive curiosity. He let her talk and demand until she was tired, without himself uttering a word, and then he said:

2 "You say you are my eldest son's wife. If that is true, and if the proof you offer is too much for us, the law is on your side. In that case, your boy is Lord Fauntleroy. The matter will be sifted to the bottom, you may rest assured. If your claims are proved, you will be provided for. I want to see nothing of either you or the child so long as I live. The place will unfortunately have enough of you after my death. You are exactly the kind of person I should have expected my son Bevis to choose."

3 And then he turned his back upon her and stalked out of the room as he had stalked into it.

4 Not many days after that, a visitor was announced to Mrs. Errol, who was writing in her little morning room. The maid, who brought the message, looked rather excited; her eyes were quite round with amazement, in fact, and being young and inexperienced, she regarded her mistress with nervous sympathy.

5 "It's the Earl hisself, ma'am!" she said in tremulous awe.

6 When Mrs. Errol entered the drawing-room, a very tall, majestic-looking old man was standing on the tiger-skin rug. He had a handsome, grim old face, with an aquiline profile, a long white mustache, and an obstinate look.

7 "Mrs. Errol, I believe?" he said.

8 "Mrs. Errol," she answered.

9 "I am the Earl of Dorincourt," he said.

Wisewire
Copyright © 2016. All rights reserved.

10 He paused a moment, almost unconsciously, to look into her uplifted eyes. They were so like the big, affectionate, childish eyes he had seen uplifted to his own so often every day during the last few months, that they gave him a quite curious sensation.

11 “The boy is very like you,” he said abruptly.

12 “It has been often said so, my lord,” she replied, “but I have been glad to think him like his father also.”

13 As Lady Lorridaile had told him, her voice was very sweet, and her manner was very simple and dignified. She did not seem in the least troubled by his sudden coming.

14 “Yes,” said the Earl, “he is like—my son—too.” He put his hand up to his big white mustache and pulled it fiercely. “Do you know,” he said, “why I have come here?”

15 “I have seen Mr. Havisham,” Mrs. Errol began, “and he has told me of the claims which have been made——”

16 “I have come to tell you,” said the Earl, “that they will be investigated and contested, if a contest can be made. I have come to tell you that the boy shall be defended with all the power of the law. His rights——”

17 The soft voice interrupted him.

18 “He must have nothing that is NOT his by right, even if the law can give it to him,” she said.

19 “Unfortunately the law can not,” said the Earl. “If it could, it should. This outrageous woman and her child——”

20 “Perhaps she cares for him as much as I care for Cedric, my lord,” said little Mrs. Errol. “And if she was your eldest son’s wife, her son is Lord Fauntleroy, and mine is not.”

21 She was no more afraid of him than Cedric had been, and she looked at him just as Cedric would have looked, and he, having been an old tyrant all his life, was privately pleased by it. People so seldom dared to differ from him that there was an entertaining novelty in it.

22 “I suppose,” he said, scowling slightly, “that you would much prefer that he should not be the Earl of Dorincourt.”

23 Her fair young face flushed.

24 “It is a very magnificent thing to be the Earl of Dorincourt, my lord,” she said. “I know that, but I care most that he should be what his father was—brave and just and true always.”

25 “In striking contrast to what his grandfather was, eh?” said his lordship sardonically.

Wisewire
Copyright © 2016. All rights reserved.

26 “I have not had the pleasure of knowing his grandfather,” replied Mrs. Errol, “but I know my little boy believes——” She stopped short a moment, looking quietly into his face, and then she added, “I know that Cedric loves you.”

27 “Would he have loved me,” said the Earl dryly, “if you had told him why I did not receive you at the Castle?”

28 “No,” answered Mrs. Errol, “I think not. That was why I did not wish him to know.”

29 “Well,” said my lord brusquely, “there are few women who would not have told him.”

30 He suddenly began to walk up and down the room, pulling his great mustache more violently than ever.

31 “Yes, he is fond of me,” he said, “and I am fond of him. I can’t say I ever was fond of anything before. I am fond of him. He pleased me from the first. I am an old man, and was tired of my life. He has given me something to live for. I am proud of him. I was satisfied to think of his taking his place some day as the head of the family.”

32 He came back and stood before Mrs. Errol.

33 “I am miserable,” he said. “Miserable!”

34 He looked as if he was. Even his pride could not keep his voice steady or his hands from shaking. For a moment it almost seemed as if his deep, fierce eyes had tears in them. “Perhaps it is because I am miserable that I have come to you,” he said, quite glaring down at her. “I used to hate you; I have been jealous of you. This wretched, disgraceful business has changed that. After seeing that repulsive woman who calls herself the wife of my son Bevis, I actually felt it would be a relief to look at you. I have been an obstinate old fool, and I suppose I have treated you badly. You are like the boy, and the boy is the first object in my life. I am miserable, and I came to you merely because you are like the boy, and he cares for you, and I care for him. Treat me as well as you can, for the boy’s sake.”

35 He said it all in his harsh voice, and almost roughly, but somehow he seemed so broken down for the time that Mrs. Errol was touched to the heart. She got up and moved an arm-chair a little forward.

36 “I wish you would sit down,” she said in a soft, pretty, sympathetic way. “You have been so much troubled that you are very tired, and you need all your strength.”

37 It was just as new to him to be spoken to and cared for in that gentle, simple way as it was to be contradicted. He was reminded of “the boy” again, and he actually did as she asked him. Perhaps his disappointment and wretchedness were good discipline for him; if he had not been wretched he might have continued to hate her, but just at present he found her a little soothing. Almost anything would have seemed pleasant by contrast with Lady Fauntleroy; and this one had so sweet a face and voice, and a pretty dignity when she spoke or moved. Very soon, through the quiet magic of these influences, he began to feel less gloomy, and then he talked still more.

Wisewire
Copyright © 2016. All rights reserved.

38 “Whatever happens,” he said, “the boy shall be provided for. He shall be taken care of, now and in the future.”

39 Before he went away, he glanced around the room.

40 “Do you like the house?” he demanded.

41 “Very much,” she answered.

42 “This is a cheerful room,” he said. “May I come here again and talk this matter over?”

43 “As often as you wish, my lord,” she replied.

44 And then he went out to his carriage and drove away, Thomas and Henry almost stricken dumb upon the box at the turn affairs had taken.

1. Read the following descriptions of how the young boy who is born to the Earl’s oldest son is portrayed.

   The boy is sloppy and eating a messy candy.

   The Earl describes the boy as “outrageous.”

   The boy is named Bevis.

   The boy is unnamed.

   The boy is a disturbing thought for the Earl.

Which statement provides a description from the text? From the movie? From both? Write your answers in the chart below.

Passage	Both	Film

Wisewire
Copyright © 2016. All rights reserved.

2. Which sentence from *Little Lord Fauntleroy* **best** matches where the music begins in the *Little Lord Fauntleroy* film?

   A. "Not many days after that, a visitor was announced to Mrs. Errol, who was writing in her little morning room." (paragraph 4)
   B. "The maid, who brought the message, looked rather excited; her eyes were quite round with amazement, in fact, and being young and inexperienced, she regarded her mistress with nervous sympathy." (paragraph 4)
   C. "When Mrs. Errol entered the drawing-room, a very tall, majestic-looking old man was standing on the tiger-skin rug." (paragraph 6)
   D. "He had a handsome, grim old face, with an aquiline profile, a long white mustache, and an obstinate look." (paragraph 6)

Read the poem and listen to the accompanying audio. Then answer the questions.

The Charge of the Light Brigade
by Alfred Tennyson

Audio:
http://ia801502.us.archive.org/14/items/charge_of_the_light_brigade_1503.poem_librivox/lightbrigade_tennyson_sgt_64kb.mp3

I.

HALF a league, half a league,
  Half a league onward,
All in the valley of Death
  Rode the six hundred.
"Forward, the Light Brigade!
Charge for the guns!" he said:
Into the valley of Death
  Rode the six hundred.

II.

"Forward, the Light Brigade!"
Was there a man dismay'd?
Not tho' the soldier knew
  Some one had blunder'd:
Theirs not to make reply,
Theirs not to reason why,
Theirs but to do and die:
Into the valley of Death
  Rode the six hundred.

Wisewire
Copyright © 2016. All rights reserved.

III.

Cannon to right of them,
Cannon to left of them,
Cannon in front of them
  Volley'd and thunder'd;
Storm'd at with shot and shell,
Boldly they rode and well,
Into the jaws of Death,
Into the mouth of Hell
  Rode the six hundred.

IV.

Flash'd all their sabres bare,
Flash'd as they turn'd in air
Sabring the gunners there,
Charging an army, while
  All the world wonder'd:
Plunged in the battery-smoke
Right thro' the line they broke;
Cossack and Russian
Reel'd from the sabre-stroke
  Shatter'd and sunder'd.
Then they rode back, but not
  Not the six hundred.

V.

Cannon to right of them,
Cannon to left of them,
Cannon behind them
  Volley'd and thunder'd;
Storm'd at with shot and shell,
While horse and hero fell,
They that had fought so well
Came thro' the jaws of Death,
Back from the mouth of Hell,
All that was left of them,
  Left of six hundred.

Wisewire
Copyright © 2016. All rights reserved.

VI.

When can their glory fade?
O the wild charge they made!
All the world wonder'd.
Honor the charge they made!
Honor the Light Brigade,
Noble six hundred!

3. Which **three** of the following **best** explains how the male speaker impacts the poem?

   A. The male speaker creates realism since the soldiers were all men.
   B. The male speaker emphasizes the serious and dangerous tone.
   C. The male speaker can better pronounce the words clearly and forcefully.
   D. The male speaker sounds like he is leading the soldiers to battle.
   E. The male speaker can change his voice to perform the different characters.

4. Which statements describe the experiences of reading the poem "The Charge of the Light Brigade" and which describe the experiences of listening to the audio? Place an x in the correct box for each statement.

Statement	**"The Charge of the Light Brigade" text**	**"The Charge of the Light Brigade" audio**
The audience can closely examine the rhyme pattern.		
The audience can perceive the emotions of the speaker.		
The audience can detect the rhythm and cadence of the language.		
The audience can draw conclusions about the structure of the poem.		
The audience can clearly distinguish dialogue.		

Wisewire
Copyright © 2016. All rights reserved.